Summary and True Extract of the Minutes of the Technical Evaluation Committee held on Aug 16, 2024

Background: The meeting was convened to make decisions regarding the active procurement of KSWMP, specifically focusing on the scrutiny of proposals received in response to RFP No.: IN-SUCM-385233-CS-QCBS for the "Selection of HR Agency." The agenda was to review the technical evaluations and decide on the opening of financial proposals for the qualified bidders.

In response to the RFP published on 07 June 2024, three proposals were received before the closing date of 24/07/2024, 4:00 pm. The received proposals were opened on the same day 24/07/2024 at 4:30 pm. KSWMP has completed the technical evaluation of the bids, and the results are presented to the TEC for scrutiny and approval. The approval of the TEC is necessary to proceed with the opening of the financial proposals from the technically qualified bidders.

Key Points Discussed:

It was reported to the TEC that the bids were initially assessed to verify whether the mandatory qualification criteria (Section 21.1 Part A - Mandatory Criteria provided in Annexure 1) were satisfied. Technical proposals of consultants, who meet the criteria in Part A, shall be evaluated further using the scoring scheme provided in Part B-Scoring Criteria.

1. **Bidders' Compliance with Mandatory Criteria:**
    - **M/s Center for Management Development (CMD):** CMD met all mandatory criteria. The committee accepted the Association Certificates and CA Certified copy of payments as sufficient proof of CMD's previous work experience.
    - **M/s Ethos HR Management & Projects Private Limited:** Ethos HR was disqualified due to non-responsiveness, failing to submit necessary documents (Tech 2A & Tech 2B) and adequate CVs, and not meeting the mandatory criteria for previous similar projects and fund arrangement.
    - **M/s MSV International INC in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions for Urban Climate:** The JV met the mandatory criteria, but three of their proposed projects were not considered due to the lack of proof of JV share and unresponsive communication from the bidder.

Based on the detailed assessment, the adherence to the mandatory criteria of the three bidders is as follows:

Sl.No.	Eligibility Criteria	M/S Center for Management Development, Trivandrum (Kerala)	M/s Ethos HR Management & Projects Private Limited, Ahmedabad (Gujarat)	MSV International INC, Gurgaon (Haryana) in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions for Urban Climate, New Delhi
1	The Consultant should be a registered legal entity and should have been in business for the last 8 years (as on 30-04-2024).	Satisfied	Satisfied	Satisfied
2	The average annual turnover of the consultant in any three of the last five financial years shall be at least INR 300 Lakhs. (FY 2022-2023, 2021-2022, FY 2020-2021, FY 2019-2020, FY 2018-2019)	Satisfied	Satisfied	Satisfied
3	Should have successfully completed Minimum of one (1) similar project* for Local Self Governments/ State Governments/ Central Government in the last 8 years (as on 30-04-2024) for providing Technical Human Resources. *Similar assignment means supply of technically qualified manpower for projects in sectors such as urban infrastructure, waste management, water supply etc. for Government (Central/ State/ ULB) or public sector undertaking, parastatals with a minimum value of INR 300 Lakhs".	Satisfied	Not Satisfied	Satisfied
4	The bidder shall submit bank certified copy for the fund arrangement of 120 Lakh to	Satisfied	Not Satisfied	Satisfied

	meet the cash flow requirement			
	Whether all mandatory criteria fulfilled	Satisfied	Not Satisfied	Satisfied

2. **Technical Scoring:**
   - CMD and the JV were both evaluated based on three criteria: specific experience relevant to the assignment, qualification and competence of the proposed team, and average annual turnover.
   - **Technical Scores:**
     - **CMD:** 77.65 (Qualified)
     - **MSV International INC in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions for Urban Climate:** 73.10 (Qualified)

The scores obtained by the two bidders which satisfied the mandatory criteria is presented in the Table below.

Evaluation criteria	**Marks**	
	M/S Center for Management development Trivandrum (Kerala)	**MSV International INC, Gurgaon (Haryana) in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions For Urban Climate, New Delhi**
Specific experience of the consultant (as a firm) relevant to the assignment **40 Marks**	32.00	16.00
Qualification and Competence of Proposed Team **(40 Marks)**	25.65	37.10
Average Annual Turnover in the last five years **(20 Marks)**	20.00	20.00
Total Technical Score	**77.65**	**73.10**
Marks> 70 is Qualify	**Qualified**	**Qualified**

Decisions Taken:

1. **Disqualification:** M/s Ethos HR Management & Projects Private Limited was disqualified due to non-responsiveness.
2. **Acceptance of Proof:** The committee accepted CMD's Association Certificates and CA-certified payment records as sufficient proof of project completion.
3. **Exclusion of JV Projects:** The three projects proposed by MSV International INC in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions for Urban Climate were not considered due to the lack of proof of JV share.
4. **Approval to Open Financial Proposals:** The committee unanimously approved the opening of financial proposals for the two qualified bidders:
   - M/s Center for Management Development

- M/s MSV International INC in JV with Innovative and Comprehensive Solutions for Urban Climate

This extract captures the essential decisions and rationale discussed during the meeting.



Project Director
KSWMP